

HALOCHOSCOPE

This week's question:

On *Shabbos* morning a *shul* will reach *krias shema* very close to the latest time for it. Which of the following is the preferred way to deal with this? Should they: hurry through the first parts of *davening*; skip some parts; or should they recite *shema* before *davening*, either as a group or as individuals?

The issues:

- A) *Zman krias shema*, the timing of the mitzvah to recite *shema*
- B) The order of *davening*; *Geulah litefilah*, juxtaposing *ga'al Yisroel* with *tefilah*
- C) *Dilug*, skipping parts of *davening*; hurrying through *davening*

A) Timing of *krias shema* in the morning

The Scriptural *mitzvah* of *krias shema* is to recite it 'as you lay down and as you rise up' (or when retiring and when rising). One must recite it twice daily, once in the morning hours, when people are arising from their sleep, and once in the evening hours, when people are retiring to bed. The Talmud records various stages of nightfall or of the times that people withdraw from the streets to their homes as the earliest times that one might go to sleep. They are basically times at which the natural light of the sun is no longer detected, to varying degrees.

Maariv is centered around the Rabbinical *mitzvah* of *tefilah*, or the *shemone esrai*. *Shema* and its *brochos* are arranged to precede *shemone esrai* at *maariv*. The *brocha* following *shema* refers to *geulah*, redemption. This should be connected to the beginning of *shemone esrai*. The Talmud debates the timing of *shemone esrai* of *maariv*. It is based on the end of the time for *mincha*, the afternoon service.

At *shacharis* the timings of *shema* and *shemone esrai* are also fit together. *Shema* is connected to rising, while *shemone esrai* is linked to the morning *tamid*. The morning *shemone esrai* is also linked to sunrise. Thus, there is an optimum time and an ideal time. There is also a basic fulfillment time. The optimum time for *shacharis shemone esrai* is at sunrise. The morning *tamid* may not be offered while it is still dark. It must be offered by daylight. It was offered as early as the time that the eastern sky was reddened. This is the effect of the sun below the horizon. Some say that this is at or around the crack of dawn, or very soon thereafter. Others maintain that this time is a little later. We will assume that it is about six minutes after dawn. On a clear day, one should see some redness on the eastern horizon at this time. Though this is the time that the offering was made, or as close to this time as possible, it could be made at dawn, according to all views. Therefore, in emergency, one may say *shemone esrai* of *shacharis* at dawn.

The latest time for *shemone esrai* at *shacharis* is also a two tier time. The Talmud debates whether the *tamid* was ever offered past four hours into the day. Nonetheless,

this did not necessarily mean that it was forbidden to do so. However, language is used that indicates that it should be offered in the earlier part of the morning rather than the later part. Therefore, one must *daven* before the four hour time is up. If this time has passed, he must still *daven shacharis*, until midday. If midday passes, he may no longer *daven shacharis*. Depending on the circumstances, he might *daven tashlumin*, repeating *mincha's shemone esrai* twice to make up for his lost *shacharis*.

Shema in the morning also has a tiered timing, due to its connection to *shemone esrai*. The optimum is *misheyakir*, at the point that one can discern certain things in the early light. Since one should connect the *brocha* of *geulah* to *tefilah*, and the optimum time for *tefilah* is sunrise, the other optimum time for *shema* is right before sunrise. Thus, there are two optimums. From the perspective of doing a *mitzvah* at the earliest possible moment, the optimum is *misheyakir*. The 'more optimum' is immediately before sunrise. The latest time for *shema* is when idle people who have no work arise. These are the royalty and wealthy heirs, who do not waste more than a quarter of the day in bed.

Since *shema* is really a *mitzvah* connected to the rising from sleep, if one recited it earlier, he fulfills his obligation. Some people arise very early. This early time is debated. Some say it is what we call dawn. Others maintain that it is the same as for *tefila*, the reddening of the eastern horizon. At this time, one fulfills his Scriptural obligation. The Rabbis, however, delayed the time until more people arise. Part of the reason for this is to make sure that no-one makes a mistake and says it too early. Thus, though we normally try to fulfill a *mitzvah* at the earliest opportunity, they formally instituted a later time to begin. If one already read it early, he may rely on the Scriptural timing. Nonetheless, the poskim maintain that one may not rely on this regularly, to fix his usual *shacharis* this early, unless he is *annus*, in circumstances beyond his control.

As mentioned, the latest time for *shema* in the morning is when the slowest normal person would rise to begin his day. It is presumed that princes and other spoiled people who have no work do not rise past the third quarter of the day. If daylight is divided into twelve parts, each part is considered a seasonal hour. *Krias shema* must be recited before three of these hours are up. This varies throughout the year according to the fluctuations in the length of the day. It also varies with the geographical distance from the equator.

Calculating seasonal hours is debated by the poskim. Some calculate it by the time the sun shines, from sunrise to sunset. Others calculate it by the time that the sky is considered light, from dawn to nightfall. Nightfall, in turn, is a matter of major debate. Let us assume it is about seventy-two minutes after sunset, or measured by degrees below the horizon that the sun has moved. Dawn is also debated. Some measure it by the angle of the sun below the earth's curvature (horizon). Some consider it a constant, as an average of the daylight hours and the night hours will always be the same. Some measure it other ways. To make things practical, many later authorities choose a view. Either they follow the concept of a constant both at dawn and at dusk, or they follow the sunlight hours. The latest time for *shema* according to the former view will always be about 36 minutes before the latter view. Since the former view adds 144 minutes to the sunlight calculation, it adds 12 minutes per seasonal hour. There is a view that maintains that one does not count seasonal hours, but clock hours. This is sometimes cited to justify situations like ours.

Krias shema consists of three *parshiyos*, chapters from Torah. The first is the essential *mitzvah*, to be *meyached Hashem*, acknowledge Hashem as One. This involves accepting the yoke of Hashem's kingdom. The first *passuk*, or first three *pesukim*, declare this. The rest of the first *parsha* relates to imbuing all time and places with this *mitzvah*. The second *parsha* deals with consequences, reward and punishment. It is considered accepting the yoke of *mitzvos*, individual commandments. The third passage is the *mitzvah* of *tzitzis*. It is read because it includes mention of the Exodus from Egypt. This must be mentioned each day and night. Therefore, the Rabbis required it read with *shema*. A minority equates its timing with that of *shema*. In fact, the Scriptural nature of *krias shema* is debated, but mentioning the Exodus is universally agreed to be Scripturally required. The choice of this *parsha* is Rabbinical. The *brochos* before and after *shema* are Rabbinically included in the *mitzvah*. They make mention of some critical events of the Exodus.

The poskim debate which *parshiyos* are the *mitzvah*, assuming it is Scriptural. Some include only the first part of the first *parsha*. Others include the rest of that *parsha*, or also the second *parsha*. [See Brochos 8b-9b 13a14b 26a 30a etc., Poskim. Tur Sh Ar OC 58:1-4 89:1, commentaries (Eshel Avraham). Pri Chadash OC 67. Shaagas Arye 1-2.]

B) The order of davening

Shema must be said together with the rest of *davening*, in order. Apart from the necessary connection to its *brochos* and their juxtaposition to *shemone esrai*, the earlier part of the *sidur* leads up to it meaningfully. It should be said with the congregation, whenever possible. If the *shul* will definitely miss the *zeman*, all individuals recite it earlier. If they might catch it, one may recite it early with a provision: "If I catch the *zeman*, let this be considered Torah study!" He thus keeps the possibility of the preferred fulfillment.

One source to recite it separately in these circumstances is a passage about the school of Rebi. He would briefly interrupt his studies to recite it when the time arrived. He also tried to connect the study to the Exodus. We learn from here that one need not recite the third *parsha* then. It is sufficient to recite a small part of *shema*. The poskim debate how much he recited. One can include the whole *shema* in the part of *birchos hashachar* that mentions the first *passuk*, with the aforementioned provision. Many poskim say that the third *parsha* need not be said with *brochos*. One may rely on mentioning the Exodus in *pesukei dezimra*, especially if it is said in time. There is a view that it might actually be preferable to say the entire order of the *sidur* without the *minyan* in this situation. However, this is not common practice. [See Refs to Section A. Brochos 13b 14b, Poski. Tur Sh Ar OC 46:9, commentaries.]

C) Dilug, skipping; Hurrying through davening

The Talmud says that whether one says a lot or a little, the most important thing is to have *kavanah*, intent and concentration. This refers to offerings, but poskim apply it to *mitzvos* and *tefilah* as well. It can refer to reciting slowly or saying it faster, or to saying more or less words. However, nowadays, one must adhere to the standard text of the *sidur*. Ideally, one should arrive in *shul* with enough time to say the entire order properly. He should also say it all with the *tzibur*. The Talmud discusses one who arrives late. It depends whether he can get through parts of his *tefilah* and catch up with the *minyan* to respond to *chazaras hashatz*, the repetition of *shemone esrai* by the *chazan*. The implica-

tion is that it is possible to hurry through *tefillah* when the need arises. However, one may not miss words or even fragment them. Nonetheless, this could refer to a slow *chazan*. Furthermore, the *chazan* needs to slow down anyhow for the congregation.

Another situation occurs when one is still saying his silent *amidah* and he needs to respond to the *chazan*. He may hurry at the end of the *amidah*, and skip certain additional parts. Here we see that skipping is also in order when needed. This refers specifically to skipping the *tachanunim* added at the end of *shemone esrai*. One may not skip any of the main body of *shemone esrai*, nor shorten it.

The poskim discuss one who arrives late and will not be able to start at the beginning and still catch up with the *tzibur*. The ideal is always to arrive on time, and to recite the entire *sidur* methodically. Indeed, *kabalistically*, one who skips is prone to overturning the channels that convey the *tefilos*. Many great men would recite the correct order even if they arrived late. However, the poskim say that it is more important to catch up with the *tzibur*. The references to *davening* in the correct order refer to *davening* alone. However, the poskim say that one who chooses to *daven* slowly and carefully, and will not have *kavanah* if he keeps up with the *tzibur*, may *daven* slower by himself. He should just arrange to be able to answer the main responses with them.

There is a hierarchy of skipping. The assumption is that the *birchos hashachar* need not be said with the *tzibur*. *Pesukei dezimra* must be said with them. If one needs to catch up, he skips sections of *pesukei dezimra*. He should say the *brochos* at the beginning and the end, and the major sections in the middle. At the very least he should include *ashrei*. If this will also delay him, he could begin with *birchos shema*. It is unclear whether this refers to hurrying, or without hurrying. Some poskim maintain that one should not skip the *brochos* of *pesukei dezimra* and *ashrei* at all. If he will not reach *shemone esrai* with the *tzibur*, he should not skip at all. On *Shabbos*, he should skip the extra *mizmorim* added for *Shabbos*, and say the weekday parts, but he must recite *nishmas*.

There seems to be no precedent for the *tzibur* skipping *pesukei dezimra*. There is only a precedent for shortening *chazaras hashatz* when *mincha* will otherwise be delayed past sunset. There are also grounds to skip singing and *piyutim*, when it will drag out *davening* on *Shabbos* or *Yomtov*, especially *Erev Shabbos*. The Talmud provides for shortening *shemone esrai* in emergency situations. However, to fix the time for *tefillah* such that the *tzibur* will need to skip does not count as an emergency. [See *Brochos* 17a 21b 24b, Poskim. Tur Sh Ar OC 46: 2 52 59:4 65 109:1 3, commentaries.]

In conclusion, the *tzibur* should not skip, nor hurry. They may shorten the singing. Individuals should say *shema* before *davening* with the provision mentioned.

On the parsha ... *How long shall this evil eidah exist? [14:27]* From here we derive the *minyan* of ten (the ten evil spies) [*Megillah* 23b]. Why learn from an evil *minyan*? Perhaps it is hinting that a *minyan* has the potential to be a good *minyan*, if they do things right, or an evil *minyan*!

Sponsored for the zechus of a refuah shelaimah bimehairah for Yosef Yitzchok ben Yehudis

Chaya, besoch she'ar cholei Yisroel.

© Rabbi Shimon Silver, June 2014.

Subscriptions and Sponsorships available. (412) 421-0508. halochoscope@hotmail.com